



ISO/IEC JTC 1 Special Working Group on Accessibility (SWG-A)

JTC 1 SWG-A N 496

2012-01-18

Type: Meeting Report

Title: **Meeting Report of the 15 December 2011 Teleconference Meeting of the JTC 1 Special Working Group on Accessibility (SWG-Accessibility)**

Source: JTC 1 SWG-Accessibility Secretariat and Convener

Due Date: n/a

Requested Action: For action and information as indicated.

JTC 1 SWG on Accessibility Secretariat
ITI/INCITS
1101 K Street NW, Suite 610, Washington, DC 20005
igarner@itic.org

Meeting Report of the 15 December 2011 Teleconference Meeting of the JTC 1 Special Working Group on Accessibility (SWG-Accessibility)

Meeting Schedule:

15 December 2011	14:00 - 16:00 UTC**
------------------	---------------------

** Each participant should use a time zone converter (such as <http://www.timeanddate.com/>) to determine the teleconference start time in their respective time zone.

1. Opening of Meeting (14:00 UTC - 15 December 2011) Mr. Li

Mr. Li, Convenor of the JTC 1 SWG on Accessibility welcomed the participants to the 15 December 2011 teleconference. Mr. Li noted that all recommendations of the SWG on Accessibility were accepted with minor modifications as the November 2011 JTC 1 Plenary in San Diego, California. The JTC 1 resolutions have been distributed as SWG-A N 489 and will be reviewed in detail during the April 2012 SWG on Accessibility meeting in Lexington, Kentucky, USA.

2. Introduction of Participants

Organization	Representative	Participated
Canada	Jim Carter	x
	Mary Frances Laughton	
	Beverly Milligan	
France	Josée Auber	x
Germany	Thorsten Katzmann	
Japan	Hajime Yamada	x
	Shigetoyo Nomura	x
Norway	Erlend Øverby	
United Kingdom	Kate Grant	x
	Chris Francis	x
	Andy Heath	x

United States	Andi Snow-Weaver	x
	Dwight Lewis	x
	Glenn Meyer	x
	Ken Salaets	x
	Peter Wallack	x
JTC 1/SC 29	Kate Grant	x
JTC 1/SC 35	Jim Carter	x
ITU-T FG AVA	Kate Grant	x
ITI	Ken Salaets	x
Linux Foundation	Janina Sajka	
W3C/WAI	Shadi Abou-Zahra	x
	Judy Brewer	x
SWG on Accessibility Convenor	Alex Li	x
SWG on Accessibility Secretariat	Jennifer Garner	x

3. Adoption of SWG-Accessibility Agenda

Mr. Li

The revised agenda was adopted as presented in SWG-A N 493. Mr. Li reported that Dr. Grant would join the teleconference about 30 minutes late so agenda item 5 would be addressed before agenda item 4.

Reference: [SWG-A N 493](#)

4. Review of Ad Hoc 16 Proposed Responses to SC 29/WG 1 and SWG-Directives Recommendation 6 in Advance of 3 January 2012 Deadline for February 2012 SWG-Directives Meeting

Dr. Grant

Scope: *The JTC 1 SWG on Accessibility establishes Ad Hoc 16 on Guidance for Accessible Production of Documents in Accessible Formats, in response to SWG-D Recommendation 6 and the request from SC 29/WG 1:*

Recommendation 6:

The SWG-Directives requests SWG-Accessibility work with ISO TC 171 and ITU-T and provide input on the accessible format noted in line 75 of the SD 12 on Electronic Document Preparation, Distribution and Archiving (JTC 1 N 10575) to the February 2012 meeting of the SWG-Directives in Japan.

Ad Hoc 16 will identify sources of guidance on accessible production of documents in accessible formats and produce a report on its findings to the next meeting of the SWG on Accessibility. This may involve producing a taxonomy of guidance on accessibility for document and graphic formats (and may expand to other formats, e.g., e-books).

Noting the 3 January 2012 deadline for the February 2012 meeting of the SWG-Directives, Ad Hoc 16 will:

- *Request specific references and context of use of the incomplete references in SD 12, e.g., doc, docx, odt, pdf, html*
- *Work with ISO TC 171 and ITU-T to provide input as request by 3 January 2012*

Ad Hoc 16 will research and respond to the JTC 1/SC 29/WG 1 request for clarification on lines 153 to 155 of SD 12 (N10575): "SVG and PNG should be preferred over JPEG and GIF".

Dr. Grant reviewed the report of Ad Hoc 16 contained in [SWG-A N 490](#) and noted that the report contained the notes from the group's teleconference and not a full set of recommendations to the SWG on Accessibility.

Extensive discussion ensued and the following recommendation was approved:

Recommendation 1: JTC 1 SWG on Accessibility Response to JTC 1 SWG on Directives Recommendation 6 (Sept. 2011)

In response to Recommendation 6 from the September 2011 JTC 1 SWG on Directives, the JTC 1 SWG on Accessibility notes that there has not been an opportunity to coordinate with ISO/TC 171 and ITU-T to provide input on the accessible format noted in line 75 of the SD 12 on Electronic Document Preparation, Distribution and Archiving (JTC 1 N 10575) to the February 2012 meeting of the SWG-Directives in Japan. Participants from ISO/TC 171 and ITU-T have been identified to participate in this coordinated activity going forward.

The JTC 1 SWG on Accessibility provides the following input and recommendations to the February 2012 SWG on Directives meeting on the accessible format noted in line 75 of the SD 12 on Electronic Document Preparation, Distribution and Archiving (JTC 1 N 10575) and will be able to provide additional input following the April 2012 JTC 1 SWG on Accessibility meeting:

- Templates for production of ISO standards should include guidance on how to correctly use accessibility features supported in the format used by the template, and should highlight accessibility features supported by the template
- Recommendations regarding the table of document formats:
 - Current table is inadequate, greater detail is needed
 - Should recommend use of the most up-to-date standardized file formats available, and should not allow conversion to an earlier format which might lose implemented accessibility features

- Need to be careful of use of R and P in table, where P “permitted” an alternative can be used (e.g. as necessary in ballot comments for formulae)
 - TXT should not be recommended at all, just permitted in all cases in the table
 - Inconsistencies with respect to the recommended or permitted file formats should be removed or justified, i.e., simple vs. complex with respect to administrative documents
 - Rationale of why a version of a format is recommended is needed (including a key differentiator is the format intended to be editable or not?), and more information on the accessibility features supported in different versions would be helpful
- Guidance on color, contrast, layout and other content issues may be universally applicable to any format and should be considered
 - In the future, there will need to be consideration of how the use of new devices and operating systems is changing the document formats used and possibly introducing different opportunities and barriers to accessibility.

The JTC 1 SWG on Accessibility welcomes feedback from the SWG on Directives on this interim report. The JTC 1 SWG on Accessibility requests an up-to-date report on ISO’s document production workflow for consideration at the April 2012 SWG on Accessibility meeting.

References: [SWG-A N 467](#) (SWG-Directives Recommendations), [JTC 1 N 10575](#) (REVISED JTC 1 Standing Document on Electronic Document Preparation, Distribution and Archiving), [Excerpt](#) from SWG-A N 472, [SWG-A N 487](#) (call for additional Ad Hoc 16 participants), [SWG-A N 490 \(Ad Hoc 16 report\)](#), [SWG-A N 491](#) (comments on N 490 from S Nomura)

5. Canadian Endorsement of Candidate to Serve as JTC 1 SWG on Accessibility Liaison Representative to ITU-T Focus Group on Audiovisual Media Accessibility **Dr. Carter**

Dr. Carter presented the Canadian National Body nomination of Ms. Beverly Milligan as the JTC 1 SWG on Accessibility liaison officer to the ITU-T Focus Group on Audiovisual Media Accessibility as detailed in SWG-A N 492. Ms. Milligan is prepared to attend the ITU-T FG-AVA meetings and report back to the JTC 1 SWG on Accessibility. The SWG on Accessibility participants discussed whether a formal liaison was required between the SWG and an ITU-T Focus Group as there is no restriction on membership in a Focus Group which is intended to be short-lived and transition into a Study Group. The following recommendation was approved:

Recommendation 2: JTC 1 SWG on Accessibility Participants on the ITU-T Focus Group on Audiovisual Media Accessibility

In response to SWG-A N 484/AVA-LS 003-E, the JTC 1 Special Working Group on Accessibility notes that some of its members currently participate on the ITU-T Focus Group on Audiovisual

Media Accessibility. The JTC 1 Special Working Group on Accessibility nominates Ms. Beverly Milligan as an additional member of the ITU-T Focus Group on Audiovisual Media Accessibility.

In the event coordinated input is required from the JTC 1 SWG on Accessibility to ITU-T Focus Group on Audiovisual Media Accessibility, the SWG on Accessibility Convenor, Mr. Alex Li, will serve as the Head of Delegation.

References: [SWG-A N 484](#) (ITU-T FG-AVA liaison statement), [SWG-A N 492](#) (Canadian endorsement)

6. Future Meetings

Mr. Li

Update on US offer to host April 2012 face to face meeting in Lexington, Kentucky

The US delegation reported that the next meeting would be held 16-19 April 2012 (Monday through Thursday) in Lexington, Kentucky. Remote participation will be provided for participants who cannot attend in person.

The following recommendation was approved:

Recommendation 3: 16-19 April 2012 Meeting in Lexington, Kentucky, USA

The JTC 1 SWG on Accessibility confirms its acceptance of the US National Body offer to host the next face-to-face meeting of the SWG on Accessibility in Lexington, Kentucky:

- 16-19 April 2012

Contributions for consideration at the April 2012 JTC 1 SWG on Accessibility meeting are due to the Secretariat by 15 March 2012.

The JTC 1 SWG on Accessibility will investigate using Web Ex for its future meetings.

Teleconference access will be provided for the participants who cannot participate in person.

7. Approval of Recommendations

Ms. Garner

The approved recommendations from the 15 December 2011 teleconference of the JTC 1 SWG on Accessibility were as follows:

Recommendation 1: JTC 1 SWG on Accessibility Response to JTC 1 SWG on Directives Recommendation 6 (Sept. 2011)

In response to Recommendation 6 from the September 2011 JTC 1 SWG on Directives, the JTC 1 SWG on Accessibility notes that there has not been an opportunity to coordinate with ISO/TC

171 and ITU-T to provide input on the accessible format noted in line 75 of the SD 12 on Electronic Document Preparation, Distribution and Archiving (JTC 1 N 10575) to the February 2012 meeting of the SWG-Directives in Japan. Participants from ISO/TC 171 and ITU-T have been identified to participate in this coordinated activity going forward.

The JTC 1 SWG on Accessibility provides the following input and recommendations to the February 2012 SWG on Directives meeting on the accessible format noted in line 75 of the SD 12 on Electronic Document Preparation, Distribution and Archiving (JTC 1 N 10575) and will be able to provide additional input following the April 2012 JTC 1 SWG on Accessibility meeting:

- Templates for production of ISO standards should include guidance on how to correctly use accessibility features supported in the format used by the template, and should highlight accessibility features supported by the template
- Recommendations regarding the table of document formats:
 - Current table is inadequate, greater detail is needed
 - Should recommend use of the most up-to-date standardized file formats available, and should not allow conversion to an earlier format which might lose implemented accessibility features
 - Need to be careful of use of R and P in table, where P “permitted” an alternative can be used (e.g. as necessary in ballot comments for formulae)
 - TXT should not be recommended at all, just permitted in all cases in the table
 - Inconsistencies with respect to the recommended or permitted file formats should be removed or justified, i.e., simple vs. complex with respect to administrative documents
 - Rationale of why a version of a format is recommended is needed (including a key differentiator is the format intended to be editable or not?), and more information on the accessibility features supported in different versions would be helpful
- Guidance on color, contrast, layout and other content issues may be universally applicable to any format and should be considered
- In the future, there will need to be consideration of how the use of new devices and operating systems is changing the document formats used and possibly introducing different opportunities and barriers to accessibility.

The JTC 1 SWG on Accessibility welcomes feedback from the SWG on Directives on this interim report. The JTC 1 SWG on Accessibility requests an up-to-date report on ISO’s document production workflow for consideration at the April 2012 SWG on Accessibility meeting.

Recommendation 2: JTC 1 SWG on Accessibility Participants on the ITU-T Focus Group on Audiovisual Media Accessibility

In response to SWG-A N 484/AVA-LS 003-E, the JTC 1 Special Working Group on Accessibility notes that some of its members currently participate on the ITU-T Focus Group on Audiovisual Media Accessibility. The JTC 1 Special Working Group on Accessibility nominates Ms. Beverly Milligan as an additional member of the ITU-T Focus Group on Audiovisual Media Accessibility.

In the event coordinated input is required from the JTC 1 SWG on Accessibility to ITU-T Focus Group on Audiovisual Media Accessibility, the SWG on Accessibility Convenor, Mr. Alex Li, will serve as the Head of Delegation.

Recommendation 3: 16-19 April 2012 Meeting in Lexington, Kentucky, USA

The JTC 1 SWG on Accessibility confirms its acceptance of the US National Body offer to host the next face-to-face meeting of the SWG on Accessibility in Lexington, Kentucky:

- 16-19 April 2012

Contributions for consideration at the April 2012 JTC 1 SWG on Accessibility meeting are due to the Secretariat by 15 March 2012.

The JTC 1 SWG on Accessibility will investigate using Web Ex for its future meetings.

Teleconference access will be provided for the participants who cannot participate in person.

8. Close of the Meeting (not later than 16:00 UTC – 15 December 2011)

The December 2011 meeting of the JTC 1 SWG on Accessibility adjourned at 16:18 UTC on 15 December 2011.